

Exhibit 12

Seguin, Paula

From: Dan Chiorean <dchiorean@odrlaw.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 7, 2020 11:17 AM
To: Fazli, Ario; Daniel Litvin (dlitvin@garwingerstein.com); 'rvandermeulen@labaton.com'; 'delman@gelaw.com'; Chris Letter; 'ktucker@gelaw.com'; Caitlin G. Coslett (ccoslett@bm.net)
Cc: Blad, Leiv; Murillo, Edoardo; Rosado-Diaz, Judy
Subject: RE: In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litig.

Hi Ario,

It has now been nearly a month since we spoke, and we have received no word from Lupin on the timing of production of Lupin's missing documents. Moreover, it has been twelve months since Plaintiffs and Lupin agreed upon the scope of Lupin's production, and seventeen months since Plaintiffs served our subpoena.

Plaintiffs request that Lupin immediately, but no later than Friday April 10, 2020, (1) produce the missing documents and answer Plaintiffs' data questions, or (2) provide Plaintiffs with an exact date when Lupin will complete its production and answer Plaintiffs' data questions in the near future.

Plaintiffs will interpret silence from Lupin on this matter as a sign that we have reached impasse, and proceed accordingly to seek redress from the court.

Thanks,
DC

Dan Chiorean
Odom & Des Roches, LLC
2020 Poydras Center
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130
Email: dchiorean@odrlaw.com
Tel (504) 522-0077
Fax (504) 522-0078

PRIVILEGED ATTORNEY/CLIENT, ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT. The information in this transmittal may be privileged and/or confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are neither the intended recipient(s) nor a person responsible for the delivery of this transmittal to the intended recipient(s), you are hereby notified that any distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify Odom & Des Roches, LLC immediately at (504) 522-0077 or by return email.

From: Dan Chiorean
Sent: Monday, March 23, 2020 4:09 PM
To: Fazli, Ario ; Daniel Litvin (dlitvin@garwingerstein.com) ; 'rvandermeulen@labaton.com' ; 'delman@gelaw.com' ; Chris Letter ; 'ktucker@gelaw.com' ; Caitlin G. Coslett (ccoslett@bm.net)
Cc: Blad, Leiv ; Murillo, Edoardo ; Rosado-Diaz, Judy
Subject: RE: In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litig.

Hi Ario,

I'm checking in again if you've had an opportunity to discuss with your client and have a timeline for producing the documents.

Thanks,
DC

Dan Chiorean

Odom & Des Roches, LLC
2020 Poydras Center
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130
Email: dchiorean@odrlaw.com
Tel (504) 522-0077
Fax (504) 522-0078

PRIVILEGED ATTORNEY/CLIENT, ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT. The information in this transmittal may be privileged and/or confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are neither the intended recipient(s) nor a person responsible for the delivery of this transmittal to the intended recipient(s), you are hereby notified that any distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify Odom & Des Roches, LLC immediately at (504) 522-0077 or by return email.

From: Dan Chiorean

Sent: Wednesday, March 18, 2020 3:42 PM

To: Fazli, Ario <AFazli@lowenstein.com>; Daniel Litvin (dlitvin@garwingerstein.com) <dlitvin@garwingerstein.com>; 'rvandermeulen@labaton.com' <rvandermeulen@labaton.com>; 'delman@gelaw.com' <delman@gelaw.com>; Chris Letter <cletter@odrlaw.com>; 'ktucker@gelaw.com' <ktucker@gelaw.com>; Caitlin G. Coslett (ccoslett@bm.net) <ccoslett@bm.net>

Cc: Blad, Leiv <LBlad@lowenstein.com>; Murillo, Edoardo <EMurillo@lowenstein.com>; Rosado-Diaz, Judy <jrosadodiaz@lowenstein.com>

Subject: RE: In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litig.

Hi Ario,

Do you have a timeline for production of the Lupin and Novel documents we discussed on our call last week?

Thanks,
DC

Dan Chiorean

Odom & Des Roches, LLC
2020 Poydras Center
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130
Email: dchiorean@odrlaw.com
Tel (504) 522-0077
Fax (504) 522-0078

PRIVILEGED ATTORNEY/CLIENT, ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT. The information in this transmittal may be privileged and/or confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are neither the intended recipient(s) nor a person responsible for the delivery of this transmittal to the intended recipient(s), you are hereby notified that any distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify Odom & Des Roches, LLC immediately at (504) 522-0077 or by return email.

From: Fazli, Ario <AFazli@lowenstein.com>

Sent: Monday, March 9, 2020 2:52 PM

To: Dan Chiorean <dchiorean@odrlaw.com>; Daniel Litvin (dlitvin@garwingerstein.com) <dlitvin@garwingerstein.com>; 'rvandermeulen@labaton.com' <rvandermeulen@labaton.com>; 'delman@gelaw.com' <delman@gelaw.com>; Chris Letter <cletter@odrlaw.com>; 'ktucker@gelaw.com' <ktucker@gelaw.com>; Caitlin G. Coslett (ccoslett@bm.net) <ccoslett@bm.net>

Cc: Blad, Leiv <LBlad@lowenstein.com>; Murillo, Edoardo <EMurillo@lowenstein.com>; Rosado-Diaz, Judy <jrosadodiaz@lowenstein.com>

Subject: RE: In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litig.

Hi Dan,

We are available to discuss tomorrow afternoon. If you are available tomorrow afternoon, please circulate a dial-in that we can use.

Thank you,
Ario

Ario Fazli
Associate
Lowenstein Sandler LLP

T: 202.753.3778

From: Dan Chiorean <dchiorean@odrlaw.com>

Sent: Monday, March 09, 2020 10:57 AM

To: Fazli, Ario <AFazli@lowenstein.com>; Daniel Litvin (dlitvin@garwingerstein.com) <dlitvin@garwingerstein.com>; 'rvandermeulen@labaton.com' <rvandermeulen@labaton.com>; 'delman@gelaw.com' <delman@gelaw.com>; Chris Letter <cletter@odrlaw.com>; 'ktucker@gelaw.com' <ktucker@gelaw.com>; Caitlin G. Coslett (ccoslett@bm.net) <ccoslett@bm.net>

Cc: Blad, Leiv <LBlad@lowenstein.com>; Murillo, Edoardo <EMurillo@lowenstein.com>; Rosado-Diaz, Judy <jrosadodiaz@lowenstein.com>

Subject: RE: In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litig.

Good morning Ario,

We've completed review of Lupin and Novel's productions. Do you have availability to discuss, perhaps tomorrow?

Thanks,
DC

Dan Chiorean
Odom & Des Roches, LLC
2020 Poydras Center
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130
Email: dchiorean@odrlaw.com

Tel (504) 522-0077

Fax (504) 522-0078

PRIVILEGED ATTORNEY/CLIENT, ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT. The information in this transmittal may be privileged and/or confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are neither the intended recipient(s) nor a person responsible for the delivery of this transmittal to the intended recipient(s), you are hereby notified that any distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify Odom & Des Roches, LLC immediately at (504) 522-0077 or by return email.

From: Fazli, Ario <AFazli@lowenstein.com>

Sent: Friday, February 28, 2020 11:12 AM

To: Dan Chiorean <dchiorean@odrlaw.com>; Daniel Litvin (dlitvin@garwingerstein.com) <dlitvin@garwingerstein.com>; 'rvandermeulen@labaton.com' <rvandermeulen@labaton.com>; 'delman@gelaw.com' <delman@gelaw.com>; Chris Letter <cletter@odrlaw.com>; 'ktucker@gelaw.com' <ktucker@gelaw.com>; Caitlin G. Coslett (ccoslett@bm.net) <ccoslett@bm.net>

Cc: Blad, Leiv <LBlad@lowenstein.com>; Murillo, Edoardo <EMurillo@lowenstein.com>; Rosado-Diaz, Judy <jrosadodiaz@lowenstein.com>

Subject: In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litig.

Counsel,

Please see the attached correspondence. The referenced Sharefile link is below, and the password will be sent to you via separate cover.

<https://lowensteinsandler.sharefile.com/d-s810b0008d16455ca>

Regards,

Ario

Ario Fazli

Associate

Lowenstein Sandler LLP

T: 202.753.3778



This message contains confidential information, intended only for the person(s) named above, which may also be privileged. Any use, distribution, copying or disclosure by any other person is strictly prohibited. In such case, you should delete this message and kindly notify the sender via reply e-mail. Please advise immediately if you or your employer does not consent to Internet e-mail for messages of this kind.

This message contains confidential information, intended only for the person(s) named above, which may also be privileged. Any use, distribution, copying or disclosure by any other person is strictly prohibited. In such case, you should

delete this message and kindly notify the sender via reply e-mail. Please advise immediately if you or your employer does not consent to Internet e-mail for messages of this kind.